

SECRET

11

DDTR

Approved For Release 2001/11/23 : CIA-RDP81-00896R000100170002-8

25X1A

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10 Director of the Office of Training at CIA, which indeed
11 does conduct ^{s/} training courses for intelligence analysts, and
12 we feel that the training conducted in those courses is
13 applicable for indications analysis as ^{will as} for other types of
14 intelligence analysis. And I think the statement that is
15 underlined on page 6 of your report points this out very
16 nicely.

17 We offer three different intelligence analysis courses,
18 ^{an} and that is specifically for analysts, although there are other
19 training courses ^{offered by} for analysts as well. In these courses we
20 try to cover the very things that I have heard you talking
21 to the Defense representatives here today. For example, we
22 cover such things as methodologies that are available to and
23 help clarify analysis, and in fact we have one very interesting
24 exercise which is also run on a computer, a PDP-1145, which
25 is based upon Bayesian analysis, which is an effort to teach
Bayesian

Approved For Release 2001/11/23 : CIA-RDP81-00896R000100170002-8

Approved For Release 2001/11/23 : CIA-RDP81-00896R000100170002-8
1 people to change the values of their predictions based upon
2 receipt of successive data. This is something that analysts --
3 and I am an old intelligence analyst ~~and know~~ that you tend
4 to hang on to the hypothesis that ~~you~~ start out with, and
5 as you get new data, ~~you~~ ^{NOT to} ~~don't~~ change ~~your~~ hypothesis. Well,
6 this is an attempt to teach people how to do that.

7 Another area that we teach ~~them~~ in is what is called
8 subjective probability assessment, to sharpen up their judg-
9 ments. If I could explain it like this, they are asked to
10 make judgments ~~about~~ -- and this is in exercises ^(USING) factual
11 statements or predictions ~~and~~ ^{the} to place a probability upon the
12 likelihood of these things, and then having done so, to give
13 an indication of the confidence that they have in their own
14 judgment. ~~And~~ You can train people through this technique
15 to improve their judgments and ~~in effect~~ upon the confidence
16 ^{making them} that they have in ~~it~~, and to do a little bit better job of
17 doing that and in communicating it to the people that use the
18 intelligence product ~~that stems from this~~.

19 Finally, in this area, we have worked on the question of
20 ~~bias~~ ^{ING}, addressed the question of institutional bias which is
21 pretty easily identified, unit bias ^{an} different parts of
22 organizations have different biases, but above all, the really
23 difficult one is the bias that resides in each individual. It
24 is harder to identify and it is harder to do something about
25 because it is based upon that person's background and

SECRET

13

Approved For Release 2001/11/23 : CIA-RDP81-00896R000100170002-8

1 experiences, perhaps cognitive bias, you might say.

2 And finally, one of the kinds of things that we do in
3 these programs -- we have three different courses here -- is
4 in the area of creativity, of helping them to think up new
5 hypotheses, to address that. In that connection we have got

6

7

8

9

10 of what makes people think/creatively, and they have been very
11 cooperative with us and have given us the benefit of a lot
12 of their research and of training programs that they have
13 conducted.

14 We originally sent people down there for training, and
15 subsequently, one of their principal training programs was
16 transferred in-house and is conducted now at CIA six times a
17 year with the assistance of these people.

18 We have three different courses for different levels of
19 people. These are all intelligence analysis courses, and they
20 vary in length from two weeks to four weeks, and the numbers
21 (of students per class) vary around 15 to 20. We have a total capacity of training for
22 about 300 people a year. We do not train specifically, as the
23 little statement said, in indications and warning, and we do send
24 people over to Captain [redacted] course at the Defense Intelligence
25 SCHOOL.

Approved For Release 2001/11/23 : CIA-RDP81-00896R000100170002-8

25X1A

25X1A

SECRET

6

Approved For Release 2001/11/23 : CIA-RDP81-00896R000100170002-8

14

1 Mr. Rose. Do all analysts at the CIA benefit from these
2 course?
3

25X1A

4 Not all analysts have taken the courses,
5 particularly people who have been around for a while. Some of
6 these are fairly new programs that have not been under way for
7 a long time. I guess we would like to think ^{that, or} ~~we~~ are doing the
8 training, that if ~~they~~ ^{they} take them, they would certainly benefit
from them.

9 I think we start from the point of view that we expect
10 people to be able to analyze and to think when they are hired.
11 That is one of the things that we don't expect to have to teach
12 them after they get there.

13 Mr. Rose. How do you ^{test} ~~text~~ them to make sure that they can
14 do that when you hire them?

25X1A

15 Well, there's a variety of ways. One is we
16 do give a variety of psychological tests to them in the first
17 place to establish their IQ. I am not an expert on this, sir,
18 and I can't go into it in great depth. We do a lot of inter-
19 viewing of them at that time by people who are experienced in
the ~~intelligence~~
20 this field. We would not rely on test batteries by themselves.
21 And we obviously look at their previous experience, education,
22 academic transcripts, and above all, ^(WE) contact with the people that
23 they have worked for or in their communities. I think ~~is~~ of
24 interest to us, ^{-- that} ~~we can get a~~ contact, basically looking at their background
25 ~~and that~~ ^{of, and that}

25X1A

Approved For Release 2001/11/23 : CIA-RDP81-00896R000100170002-8

Next 1 Page(s) In Document Exempt

Approved For Release 2001/11/23 : CIA-RDP81-00896R000100170002-8

Approved For Release 2001/11/23 : CIA-RDP81-00896R000100170002-8
Mr. Rose. You said you have three courses?

25X1A

[REDACTED] Yes, sir.

3 Mr. Rose. What are the titles of those courses? Do you
4 have them?

25X1A

5 [REDACTED] Yes, indeed. Seminar on Intelligence
6 Analysis, which runs four times each year for three weeks,
7 Introduction to Analysis for Career Trainees -- those are
8 entry level people -- which ~~is run~~ ^{The third is} it is two weeks and
9 ~~it is~~ run four times a year. ~~We have~~ something called the
10 Intelligence Process Course, which is conducted twice a year,
11 four weeks in length.

12 Mr. Rose. Does the Intelligence Process Course, which
13 teaches analysts to make finished intelligence meaningful
14 to executive-level policy makers, does it deal specifically
15 with warning?

25X1A

16 [REDACTED] Yes, but only in a very short fashion. There
17 is not much coverage on warning in it.

18 Mr. Rose. The National Intelligence Daily, which serves a
19 high-level audience, could be considered to have a warning
20 function. Are the articles in the NID evaluated for their
21 predictive accuracy?

22

25X1A [REDACTED] I had better come up to the table.

23

Mr. Rose. Come on.

24

25X1A [REDACTED] No, sir, they are not. We ran an experiment
25 in this, not with the NID because it didn't exist at the

Approved For Release 2001/11/23 : CIA-RDP81-00896R000100170002-8

~~SECRET~~

Approved For Release 2001/11/23 : CIA-RDP81-00896R000100170002-8

2
18

1 time, but with its predecessor, the National Intelligence
2 Bulletin, and we found that it was not a fruitful exercise,
3 that you ran into too many the-sun-will-rise-tomorrow predic-
4 tions. If the analysts knew we were grading them on this, we
5 would run into a great many more of them, and there were any
6 number of pitfalls in it that made the statistics that we
7 came up with quite meaningless.

8 Mr. Rose. Some procedures have been developed to
9 reduce or compensate for the effects of perceptual bias in
10 human mental processes, as you mentioned. For example,
11 repetitive training with constant feedback allows airline
12 pilots to compensate for illusions such as things appearing
13 to be closer on clear days than on hazy days.

14 Does the CIA provide any training to its analysts which
15 will actually help them overcome cognitive biases?

25X1A
16 [REDACTED]. I referred a moment ago, sir, to two exercises
17 which are done ⁱⁿ ~~real~~ live, at, say, a computer terminal keyboard,
18 which provides instant feedback. One of those exercises is
19 this business of adjusting one's hypothesis based upon the
20 receipt of new data. It is based on Bayes' work, or Bayesian
21 algebra. The other is a subjective probability test where one
22 is able to get instant feedback.

23 I think these are in that general ballpark. I think they
24 are very limited and they may be somewhat primitive, but I do
25 Approved For Release 2001/11/23 : CIA-RDP81-00896R000100170002-8
think that this is apropos as far as intelligence analysis

SECRET

Approved For Release 2001/11/23 : CIA-RDP81-00896R000100170002-8

19

1 work is concerned.

2 Mr. Rose. All right, thank you very much.

3 (Whereupon, at 3:14 o'clock p.m., the Subcommittee
4 proceeded to the consideration of other matters.)

5 - - -

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Approved For Release 2001/11/23 : CIA-RDP81-00896R000100170002-8